

## APPENDIX 4: MULTIPLE VICTIM CASES WHERE JURY REJECTED DEATH PENALTY

This table summarizes more than eighty cases over a thirty-five-year period from 1982 to 2018 from federal and state courts in twenty-three different states, plus the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico and the District of Columbia.

Name	State	Type	Year of verdict	Description	Sentence	Source <sup>†</sup>
Aguirre, Roberto Rojas	Texas	State	2011	Murder of 8 y/o & 6 y/o stepsons & 3 y/o son & mother-in-law	LWOP	<a href="http://valleycentral.com/news/local/alton-man-gets-life-in-prison-for-family-murder">http://valleycentral.com/news/local/alton-man-gets-life-in-prison-for-family-murder</a>
Alvarez, Dennis	N.Y.	State	2002	Murder of 28 y/o women and her two children in their apartment (Non-unanimous jury)	LWOP	<a href="http://www.nytimes.com/2003/05/24/nyregion/jury-deadlock-spare-life-of-man-guilty-in-3-murders.html">http://www.nytimes.com/2003/05/24/nyregion/jury-deadlock-spare-life-of-man-guilty-in-3-murders.html</a>
Bass, John	Mich.	Fed.	2006	Four drug-related murder victims	LWOP	United States v. Bass, 460 F.3d 830 (6th Cir. 2006)
Beckford, Dean Anthony	Va.	Fed.	2000	Six drug-related murders	LWOP	United States v. Beckford, 968 F. Supp. 1080 (E.D. Va. 1997)
Bell, George	N.Y.	State	1999	Shot and killed off-duty police officer and owner of check cashing store in attempted robbery	LWOP	People v. Bell, 181 Misc.2d 186 (N.Y. Sup. Ct. 1999)
Buono, Angelo	Cal.	State	1983	“Hillside Strangler,” 9 victims	LWOP	<a href="http://murderpedia.org/male/B/b/buono-angelo.htm">http://murderpedia.org/male/B/b/buono-angelo.htm</a>
Burkett, Jason	Tex.	State	2003	Murdered 3; also kidnapped 2	Life	Burkett v. State, 172 S.W.3d 250 (Tex. App. 2005)

<sup>†</sup> All hyperlinks were accessed by the author on Nov. 1, 2017 and subsequently by the *Hofstra Law Review* on Aug. 23, 2018, except for cases from 2018 whose links were accessed on the date the online report appeared.

Cagle, Randy	N.C.	State	2016	Murdered 3; also kidnapped	LWOP	<a href="https://www.greensboro.com/news/man-gets-life-sentence-for-two-seagrove-murders/article_11097510-6c70-5b4b-a346-511a0e4afea6.html">https://www.greensboro.com/news/man-gets-life-sentence-for-two-seagrove-murders/article_11097510-6c70-5b4b-a346-511a0e4afea6.html</a>
Campbell, Eric	N.C.	State	2017	Murdered 2	LWOP	<a href="https://www.wral.com/texas-man-gets-life-sentence-for-robbing-killing-granville-couple/16945478">https://www.wral.com/texas-man-gets-life-sentence-for-robbing-killing-granville-couple/16945478</a>
Candelario Santana, Alexis	P.R.	Fed.	2013	“La Tombola Massacre” in which eight people were killed; defendant previously convicted of killing or ordering others to kill 13 others he viewed as threats or disloyal	LWOP	<a href="http://www.upi.com/Top_News/World-News/2013/03/25/No-death-penalty-for-PR-mass-killer/UPI-14261364256284">http://www.upi.com/Top_News/World-News/2013/03/25/No-death-penalty-for-PR-mass-killer/UPI-14261364256284</a>
Cisneros, Ismael	Va.	Fed.	2005	Members of MS-13 who murdered pregnant 17 y/o who became informant (Co-D with Grande)	LWOP	<a href="http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2005/06/14/AR2005061401451.html">http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2005/06/14/AR2005061401451.html</a>
Clay, Brian	Nev.	State	2017	Rape murder of 10 y/o girl and her mother	LWOP	<a href="https://www.reviewjournal.com/crime/courts/jury-s pares-life-of-las-vegas-man-who-killed-girl-mother">https://www.reviewjournal.com/crime/courts/jury-s pares-life-of-las-vegas-man-who-killed-girl-mother</a>
Cooper, Samuel	N.C.	State	2010	Murdered 5	LWOP	<a href="https://wral.com/new/local/story/7453332">https://wral.com/new/local/story/7453332</a>
Daoud, Mohamed Rashed	N.Y.	Fed.	2001	Involved in the terrorist bombing at American embassies that killed 224 people, including 12 Americans, and injured more than 5000 (Co-D with Khamis Mohamed)	LWOP	<a href="http://www.edition.cnn.com/2001/LAW/10/19/embassy.bombings">http://www.edition.cnn.com/2001/LAW/10/19/embassy.bombings</a>

Davidson, Latine	Ind.	State		Murdered 2 of her own children	120 yrs	Davidson v. State, 558 N.E.2d 1077 (Ind. 1990)
Duong, Anh The	Cal.	Fed.	2011	Murdered 3; plus 4 prior murders	LWOP	<a href="https://www.mercurynews.com/2011/02/03/sanjose-gang-leader-sentenced-to-life-in-prison-for-murders-racketeering">https://www.mercurynews.com/2011/02/03/sanjose-gang-leader-sentenced-to-life-in-prison-for-murders-racketeering</a>
Ealy, Samuel Stephan	Va.	Fed.	2002	Shotgun murder of family of 3	LWOP	<a href="https://www.highbeam.com/doc/1P2-9866199.html">https://www.highbeam.com/doc/1P2-9866199.html</a>
Edelin, Tommy	D.C.	Fed.	2004	14 drug-related murders, including 14 y/o, and attempting to have another dozen people killed	LWOP	United States v. Edelin, 134 F. Supp. 2d 59 (D.D.C. 2001)
French, Kenneth	N.C.	State	1994	Murdered 4 in restaurant	LWOP	State v. French 467 S.E.2d 412 (N.C. 1996)
Galloway, Glen Law	Colo.	State	2018	Alleged stalker murdered two back-to-back	LWOP	<a href="https://gazette.com/news/no-death-penalty-for-double-killer-galloway-jury-decides/article_32d4c3dc-7eea-11e8-93b7-9b905eebf163.html">https://gazette.com/news/no-death-penalty-for-double-killer-galloway-jury-decides/article_32d4c3dc-7eea-11e8-93b7-9b905eebf163.html</a>
Gilbert, Kristin	Mass.	Fed.	2001	Nurse murdered four patients and attempted to murder three others	LWOP	United States v. Gilbert, 92 F. Supp. 2d 1 (D. Mass. 2000)
Gordon, James	N.Y.	State	1998	Raped, sodomized and murdered two women, and attempted to murder two others	LWOP	<a href="http://www.nytimes.com/1998/12/19/nyregion/queens-jury-spare-convicted-killer-from-death-penalty.html">http://www.nytimes.com/1998/12/19/nyregion/queens-jury-spare-convicted-killer-from-death-penalty.html</a>
Grande, Oscar	Va.	Fed.	2005	Members of MS-13 who murdered pregnant 17 y/o who became informant (Co-D with Cisneros)	LWOP	<a href="http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2005/06/14/AR2005061401451.html">http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2005/06/14/AR2005061401451.html</a>

Gray, Kevin L.	D.C.	Fed.	2005	30 drug-related murders (Co-D with Rodney Moore)	LWOP	<a href="http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2005/03/25/AR2005032506044.html">http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2005/03/25/AR2005032506044.html</a>
Green, Steven Dale	Ky.	Fed.	2009	Murder of Iraqi family of 4, including children aged 6 and 14, and rape murder of 14 y/o daughter	LWOP	<a href="https://www.cbsnews.com/news/soldier-gets-5-life-sentences-iraqi-deaths">https://www.cbsnews.com/news/soldier-gets-5-life-sentences-iraqi-deaths</a>
Hall, Keith Lavoris	N.C.	State	2006	Murdered 4	LWOP	<a href="http://www.wistv.com/story/5773804/life-sentence-imposed-after-nc-jury-deadlocks-on-death?clienttype=printable">http://www.wistv.com/story/5773804/life-sentence-imposed-after-nc-jury-deadlocks-on-death?clienttype=printable</a>
Hartley, Kenneth	N.C.	State	2011	Murder of mother and 14 y/o half- brother by stabbing; anal rape & strangulation murder of 9 y/o half-sister	LWOP	State v. Hartley, 710 S.E.2d 385 (N.C. Ct. App. 2011)
Henderson, Philip Wayne	Cal.	State	1982	Triple murder of entire family, plus unborn fetus at 30 weeks old	LWOP	<a href="http://law.justia.com/cases/california/court-of-appeal/3d/225/1129.html">http://law.justia.com/cases/california/court-of-appeal/3d/225/1129.html</a>
Holden, Nathan	N.C.	State	2017	Murdered 2	LWOP	<a href="https://www.newsobserver.com/news/local/crime/article136232738.html">https://www.newsobserver.com/news/local/crime/article136232738.html</a>
Holmes, James	Colo.	State	2015	Multiple murder in Aurora theater shooting; one of 12 deceased victims was a 6 y/o child	LWOP	<a href="http://www.cnn.com/2015/08/26/us/james-holmes-aurora-massacre-sentencing/index.html">http://www.cnn.com/2015/08/26/us/james-holmes-aurora-massacre-sentencing/index.html</a> ; <a href="http://www.thedenverchannel.com/news/movie-theater-shooting/james-holmes-verdict-life-in-prison-for-aurora-colorado-theater-gunman-jury-rejects-death-penalty">http://www.thedenverchannel.com/news/movie-theater-shooting/james-holmes-verdict-life-in-prison-for-aurora-colorado-theater-gunman-jury-rejects-death-penalty</a>

Holmes, Steven	Ind.	State		Murdered both his parents	140 yrs	Holmes v. State 642 N.E.2d 970 (Ind. 1994)
Horn, Lawrence	Md.	State	1996	Ordered triple murder of quadriplegic 8 y/o son, wife, and nurse	LWOP	<a href="http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2009/12/31/AR2009123102446.html">http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2009/12/31/AR2009123102446.html</a>
Johnson, Shaheem & Rahim	Va.	Fed.	2000	Five drug-related murders	LWOP	United States v. Johnson, 219 F.3d 349 (4th Cir. 2000)
Jones, Anthony	Md.	Fed.	1998	Six drug-related murders	LWOP	<a href="https://oig.justice.gov/special/9908/callsp51.htm">https://oig.justice.gov/special/9908/callsp51.htm</a>
Jones, Roman	Ind.	State		Murderd 3; attempted 2 more	235 yrs	Jones v. State 697 N.E.2d 57 (Ind. 1998)
Kehoe, Chevie O'Brien	Ark.	Fed.	2008	Murder of two adults and 8 y/o child	LWOP	United States v. Kehoe, No. 4:97-CR-00243-(1) GTE, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 115437 (E.D. Ark. Aug. 28, 2008)
Lewis, Dexter	Colo.	State	2015	Stabbed 5 to death in bar	LWOP	<a href="https://www.denverpost.com/2015/08/27/dexter-lewis-gets-life-sentence-for-feros-bar-massacre">https://www.denverpost.com/2015/08/27/dexter-lewis-gets-life-sentence-for-feros-bar-massacre</a>
Lingle, Harold	Mo.	State		Killed pregnant mother, 3 kids		State v. Lingle, 140 S.W.3d 178 (Mo. App. 2004)
Mack, Derrick	N.J.	State	1994	3 contract murders	LWOP	Dwight Ott, <i>Judge Will Decide Sentence for Mack Because Jurors Were at Odds, the Death Penalty Was Automatically Ruled Out</i> , PHILA. INQUIRER, Nov. 3, 1994
Mahone, Donald	Ind.	State		Murdered 2	100 yrs	Mahone v. State, 541 N.E.2d 278 (Ind. 1989)
Marshall, Sanford	Ind.	State		Murdered 2 cops during robbery	130 yrs	Marshall v. State 621 N.E.2d 308 (Ind. 1993)

Massey, Lloyd	N.J.	State		Murdered 3	LWOP	State v. Massey, N.J. Sup. App. Div. (Aug. 13, 2007); <a href="https://www.pressofatlanticcity.com/news/press/atlantic_city/atlantic-city-mans-triple-murder-conviction-upheld-lloyd-massey/article_1ba9c9a4-b603-11df-b0ec-001cc4c002e0.html">https://www.pressofatlanticcity.com/news/press/atlantic_city/atlantic-city-mans-triple-murder-conviction-upheld-lloyd-massey/article_1ba9c9a4-b603-11df-b0ec-001cc4c002e0.html</a>
Matthews, Courtney	Tenn.	State		Murdered 4 at Taco Bell	LWOP	State v. Matthews, No. M2005- 00843-CCA- R3-CD, 2008 WL 2662450 (Tenn. Ct. Crim. App. July 8, 2008)
McIntosh, Dalkeith	N.Y.	State	1998	Murdered his girlfriend and her daughter after domestic incident	LWOP	<a href="http://www.nytimes.com/1998/07/24/nyregion/killer-of-2-women-sentenced-to-life-instead-of-execution.html">http://www.nytimes.com/1998/07/24/nyregion/killer-of-2-women-sentenced-to-life-instead-of-execution.html</a>
McIntyre, Robert	Ind.	State		Murdered 2	LWOP	McIntyre v. State, 717 N.E.2d 114 (Ind. 1999)
Mc- Reynolds, Daryl	Ind.	State		Murdered 2; attempted 3 more	270 yrs	McReynolds v. State, 460 N.E.2d 960 (Ind. 1984)
Mills, Jonathan	Conn.	State	2004	Murder of defendant's aunt and her two children		<a href="https://www.nhrregister.com/news/article/Mills-escapes-death-penalty-11672826.php">https://www.nhrregister.com/news/article/Mills-escapes-death-penalty-11672826.php</a>
Minerd, Joseph	Pa.	Fed.	2004	Arson resulting in death of pregnant adult female, 3 y/o and fetus	LWOP	<a href="http://old.post-gazette.com/neighbor_south/20020531miner5.asp">http://old.post-gazette.com/neighbor_south/20020531miner5.asp</a>

Mohamed, Khalfan Khamis	N.Y.	Fed.	2001	Involved in the terrorist bombing at American embassies that killed 224 people, including 12 Americans, and injured more than 5000 (Co-D with Rashed Daoud)	LWOP	<a href="http://www.edition.cnn.com/2001/LAW/10/19/embassy.bombings">http://www.edition.cnn.com/2001/LAW/10/19/embassy.bombings</a>
Moore, Rodney L.	D.C.	Fed.	2005	30 drug-related murders (Co-D with Kevin Gray)	LWOP	<a href="http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2005/03/25/AR2005032506044.html">http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2005/03/25/AR2005032506044.html</a>
Moussaoui, Zacarias	Va.	Fed.	2006	20th hijacker of the September 11th attacks	LWOP	<a href="http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2006/05/03/AR2006050300324.html">http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2006/05/03/AR2006050300324.html</a>
Naddi, Toufic	Cal.	State	2003	Murdered wife, 4 other relatives	LWOP	<a href="http://articles.latimes.com/1990-09-18/local/me-521_1_family-members">http://articles.latimes.com/1990-09-18/local/me-521_1_family-members</a>
Nettles, Harold	Ind.	State	1989	Murder of mother and five-year-old		Nettles v. State, 565 N.E.2d 1064 (Ind. 1991)
Ng, Benjamin	Wash.	State		Murdered 13 in restaurant	LWOP	State v. Ng 713 P.2d 63 (Wash. 1985)
Nichols, Brian	Ga.	State	2008	Killed judge, deputy, court reporter, federal agent	LWOP	<a href="http://www.foxnews.com/story/2008/12/13/judge-sentences-atlanta-courthouse-shooter-brian-nichols-to-life-without-parole.html">http://www.foxnews.com/story/2008/12/13/judge-sentences-atlanta-courthouse-shooter-brian-nichols-to-life-without-parole.html</a>
Nichols, Terry Lynn	Colo.	Fed.	1998	Oklahoma City bombing that killed 168 people, including children (Change of Venue)	LWOP	<a href="http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-srv/national/longterm/oklahoma/stories/nichols0107.htm">http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-srv/national/longterm/oklahoma/stories/nichols0107.htm</a>

Nichols, Terry Lynn	Okla.	State	2004	Oklahoma City bombing that killed 168 people, including children. (Tried again in state court)	LWOP	<a href="http://www.nbcnews.com/id/5184483/ns/us_news-crime_and_courts/t/judge-dismisses-deadlocked-nichols-jury/#.WbgQmqhSy72">http://www.nbcnews.com/id/5184483/ns/us_news-crime_and_courts/t/judge-dismisses-deadlocked-nichols-jury/#.WbgQmqhSy72</a>
Niksich, Edward	Ind.	State		Killed 2 in phony drug deal	80 yrs	Roche v. State, 596 N.E.2d 896 (Ind. 1992)
Northington, Steven	Pa.	Fed.	2014	Conspiracy involving 13 murders, including a 2004 arson that killed 6 people, 4 of them children ages 15, 12, 10 and 1	LWOP	United States v. Northington, No. 07-550-05, 2014 WL 1786151 (E.D. Pa. May 6, 2014)
Owens, John	N.Y.	State	2000	Raped and strangled two women	LWOP	<a href="http://wxixnews.org/post/life-prison-instead-death-penalty">http://wxixnews.org/post/life-prison-instead-death-penalty</a>
Perry, Jason	Md.	State	1996	Triple murder for hire, including quadriplegic 8 y/o		<a href="http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2009/12/31/AR2009123102446.html">http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2009/12/31/AR2009123102446.html</a>
Pitera, Thomas	N.Y.	Fed.	1993	Seven mob-related contract murders in which the victims were tortured and dismembered	LWOP	United States v. Pitera, 5 F.3d 624 (2d Cir. 1993)
Postelle, David	Okla.	State	2008	Murdered 4	LWOP	<a href="https://newsok.com/article/3237994/plea-gives-insight-into-05-murders">https://newsok.com/article/3237994/plea-gives-insight-into-05-murders</a>
Powell, Tina Hickey	Ky.	State		Murdered 5		Foster v. Commonwealth, 827 S.W.2d 670 (Ky. 1991)
Price, Kerrie	Ind.	State		Murdered 2 security guards		Price v. State, 765 N.E.2d 1245 (Ind. 2002)
Puente, Dorothea	Cal.	State	1994	Murdered 3		<a href="https://www.sacbee.com/news/local/crime/article183684921.html">https://www.sacbee.com/news/local/crime/article183684921.html</a>
Roseboro, Derek	Conn.	State		Murdered 3		State v. Roseboro, 604 A.2d 1286 (Conn. 1992)



Saenz, Kimberly	Tex.	State	2012	Killed 5 at kidney dialysis center	LWOP	<a href="http://www.ktre.com/story/17311211/sentencing-for-saenz-begins-with-light-shed-on-domestic-issues">http://www.ktre.com/story/17311211/sentencing-for-saenz-begins-with-light-shed-on-domestic-issues</a>
Santiago, Jose	N.Y.	State	2000	Execution style murders of a 2 y/o girl and 14 y/o girl in their home in front of their mother	LWOP	<a href="https://www.newspapers.com/newspage/137126870">https://www.newspapers.com/newspage/137126870</a>
Scott, Michael James	Tex.	State		Killed 4 girls in yogurt shop	Life	Scott v. State, 227 S.W.3d 670 (Tex. Crim. App. 2007)
Shakir, Jamal	Tenn.	Fed.	2009	Conspiracy alleging 9 killings in three states, shooting of 3 y/o, and torture of two victims	LWOP	<a href="https://archives.fbi.gov/archives/memphis/press-releases/2009/me120709a.htm">https://archives.fbi.gov/archives/memphis/press-releases/2009/me120709a.htm</a>
Smith, Jason	Ill.	State	2008	Killed 4, including infant	LWOP	<a href="https://www.stltday.com/news/illinois-investigates-jason-smith-defense/article_cb616c71-65e4-55c3-9022-a43127cbb821.html">https://www.stltday.com/news/illinois-investigates-jason-smith-defense/article_cb616c71-65e4-55c3-9022-a43127cbb821.html</a>
Tholmer, Brandon	Cal.	State	1986	Murdered 4 elderly women; also raped and sodomized	LWOP	<a href="http://articles.latimes.com/1986-08-09/local/me-2247_1_jury-life-spare">http://articles.latimes.com/1986-08-09/local/me-2247_1_jury-life-spare</a>
Thomas, Danny	N.C.	State	2011	Killed 4 during robbery	LWOP	<a href="https://www.wwatv3.com/2011/05/19/first-3-jurors-thomas-case-deadlocked-judge-gives-life-sentence">https://www.wwatv3.com/2011/05/19/first-3-jurors-thomas-case-deadlocked-judge-gives-life-sentence</a>
Utley, James	Ind.	State		Killed mother, 3 y/o in burglary	170 yrs	Utley v. State, 589 N.E.2d 232 (Ind. 1992)
Valentin, Sammy	Ind.	State		Killed 2 in separate incidents	140 yrs	Valentin v. State, 567 N.E.2d 792 (Ind. 1991)
Vance, Michael	Ind.	State		Murdered 2 in robbery	190 yrs	Vance v. State, 620 N.E.2d 687 (Ind. 1993)

Walter, Stephen	Tex.	State		Killed 3, including pregnant woman	Life	Walter v. State, No. 06-04-00173 (Tex. App. 6 <sup>th</sup> Dist. Nov. 15, 2006)
Whitton, Douglas	La.	State		Quadruple murder	Life	State v. Whitton, No. 99-KA-1953, Court of Appeal of Louisiana, 4 <sup>th</sup> Cir. Sept. 27, 2000
Williams, Elijah & Michael	N.Y.	Fed.	2011	Execution style triple-murder	LWOP	United States v. Williams, 506 F.3d 151 (2d Cir. 2007)
Williams, Tyrone	Tex.	Fed.	2007	Alien smuggling operation what led to 19 immigrants' death by dehydration	LWOP	<a href="http://www.cbsnews.com/news/smuggler-gets-life-for-immigrant-deaths">http://www.cbsnews.com/news/smuggler-gets-life-for-immigrant-deaths</a>